

Case Study: Effectiveness of Commercial Diplomacy for Export Promotion¹

Faiz Ahmed (Pakistan Customs Service/Ex-Commercial Counselor, Madrid Spain) & Sarah Saeed (Pakistan Administrative Service/Directing Staff, NSPP)

Introduction:

A trade mission abroad works with the business objective of promoting bilateral trade and investments. Within this broad agenda, enhancing exports to the host country is the foremost priority. In the context of Pakistan, a trade mission, with rare exceptions, comprises of a Civil Servant selected by the Ministry of Commerce (MOC) supported by a Trade Development Officer (hired locally) and a Commercial Assistant (a government official). The general tendency is to locate such missions within Pakistan embassies at national capitals not only for austerity reasons but also to capitalize on synergies with political or other diplomatic initiatives. In addition to their routine budgets trade mission can tap resources from an “Export Management and Development Fund (EMDF)” for new business promotion and market outreach activities with prior approval. Despite these institutional arrangements catering for financial and HR needs, a Commercial Diplomat finds himself in uncharted territory. Prior to his arrival in the host country, his knowledge of the host country and its business dynamics is rudimentary. Post-arrival, he is cognizant of the requirement to familiarize himself with the language and culture of the host country and be up to speed in identifying and seizing upon business opportunities. The expectation is that he will develop an effective network and swiftly develop “social capital” in the host country to attain the twin objectives of export and investment promotion. The Commerce Ministry, wanting to extract value for money from the expensive arrangement of maintaining trade missions abroad, assigns export targets and subject trade missions to periodic performance monitoring.

It is assumed that a trade mission’s promotional efforts are directly linked with trade or export volumes but what transpires on ground (and is reflected in trade figures) is the outcome of a complex interplay of policies, strategies, favorable events and country perceptions. Literature offers no conclusive insights on the extent of contribution of a trade mission’s effort to export growth. Agenda-setting is in the hands of the Commercial Diplomat. The relationship between the Ministry and the trade mission, therefore, poses a ‘principal-agent’ problem, confounded further by the absence of a direct action-to-results chain.

Case Study: Effectiveness of Commercial Diplomacy for Export Promotion I

As part of the requirement of the National Management Course, an officer, Mr. Faiz Ahmed from Pakistan Customs Service developed a case study based on his experience as a Commercial Diplomat in Pakistan's trade mission at Madrid, Spain. The case study traces the performance of the trade mission that set itself an ambitious target of doubling Pakistan's exports to the host country in three years. The story explains a Commercial Diplomat's strategy that led to realization of the target within the stipulated time and offers practical insight for effective working of trade missions. The author of the case study uses the theoretical frameworks of economics (Armington Theory) and management (Freeman's Stakeholder Theory) to analyse the implementation environment and devise a workable strategy. The story he narrates is that of informed planning and careful implementation which brings out desirable skills and attributes of a successful Commercial Diplomat and enables the reader to extract useful lessons for export promotion.

Literature Review:

Despite our stated intentions of becoming an export-oriented economy, Pakistan, over the years, has lost considerable ground in comparison with other Asian economies as measured by the growth trend of exports and the share of goods' and services' exports in GDP. In 1980, Pakistan's goods' and services' exports were 12% of our GDP; in the same year, Turkey's exports were 5% of her GDP. By 2018, Pakistan's exports had contracted in relative terms to 8.5% of GDP while in the case of Turkey, exports touched 29.6% of GDP. Export performance of countries, such as Bangladesh (14.8%), India (19.7%), Indonesia (21%) and Malaysia (69.7%) has also far outmatched that of Pakistan². According to research conducted under the auspices of the State Bank of Pakistan, there has been no substantial change in Pakistan's export destinations in the last decade, despite there being a significant positive effect of globalization³.

The Armington Theory offers a standard, well-accepted explanation of trade volumes between two countries based on product differentiation by country of origin⁴. In individual markets, price-affecting measures such as tariffs and subsidies give a fillip to exports in case of commodities where price elasticities are greater than one, however, in case of inelastic products, non-price factors have a greater role in stimulating exports. 'Perceptions about the exporting country' is an example of a non-price factor linked to the importing country. Lingering commercial disputes may have an impact on perceptions and, therefore, on exports of a country, however, it is also acknowledged that a third party facilitator, well-socialised in the culture of the disputants can help quickly reach an amicable solution⁵.

According to Naray, the two key dimensions of factors that shape the nature of commercial diplomacy are organizational (such as arrangements between ministries and trade-promotion organizations, etc.) and individual (education, background and motivation). An important organizational concern is seeking effective arrangements between the Commercial Diplomat's organizational unit and the headquarters⁶. Kostecki and Naray categorise commercial diplomats into three categories based upon their style: he/she can be a "business promoter", "a civil servant" or a "generalist". The "business promoter" takes commercial issues as business concerns, is proactive and focuses on client satisfaction; the "civil servant" sees commercial issues mainly as an integral part of international relations, is reactive, provides a link between business and the ministry and focuses on the satisfaction of the Ministry of Commerce; and the "generalist" perceives commercial issues in a broader diplomatic and political perspective and accordingly cultivates high level contacts⁷.

A CASE STUDY OF EXPORT PROMOTION EFFORTS IN SPAIN:

In 2011, Spain was the 5th* largest economy in the European Union, 4th* largest in the Eurozone and 13th* largest globally. In early 2013, upon arrival in Madrid, Pakistan's new Commercial Counsellor noted that Pakistan's exports to Spain in 2012 had posted a 6% decline from € 402 million to € 379 million in a single year, albeit in the context of an overall decline in export volumes to the European Union. Spain had a number of leading textile chain stores such as Zara, Mango, etc. and textiles accounted for 3% of its GDP⁸. The fact that Spain was a leading textile and garments producer did not imply a lack of export potential for Pakistan. The Commercial Counsellor realized that following the Armington Theory approach, international trade was influenced by demand equations based on market dynamics and that the products in questions could be differentiated products from the same sector. The demand equations linked the aggregate demand in a certain country for the products of another country in terms of income, ease and availability of products, relative price differentials, access to markets and market size. In 2008, Spain was hit by a severe economic and financial crisis and its economy had continued to shrink since then. During 2nd quarter of 2013, Spain's GDP shrank by 1.6% as against a contraction by 1.8% in the 1st quarter of 2013⁹. Its unemployment rate remained very high, i.e. over 26%^{10*}. Like other crisis-hit countries in the euro zone i.e. Cyprus, Greece and Portugal, the Spanish economy was also suffering from the contagion of bad debts, liquidity crunch, frequent business closures, a high unemployment rate, drastic cuts in wages, a decline in disposable incomes, shrinking demand of consumer goods and a consequent decline in Pakistani exports in Spanish market.

Case Study: Effectiveness of Commercial Diplomacy for Export Promotion I

Starting from such a deep abyss meant that the Spanish economic revival had a potential for stimulating demand for Pakistani products. On the other hand, the Commercial Counselor's supply side analysis revealed that, apart from competitiveness issues, our energy crisis and a persistent spate of terrorism had nurtured a negative perception about Pakistan as an unreliable import source, thereby impeding market entry prospects of Pakistani merchandise.

Digging deeper, the Commercial Counsellor realized that existing institutional frameworks were not being utilized: cooperation agreements signed between Spain and Pakistan including the Agreement on Cultural Cooperation (1962), Air Services Agreement (1972 - renegotiated and re-signed in 2008), Agreement on Reciprocal Promotion and Protection of Investment (1995), Memorandum of Understanding on Financial Cooperation (1995), Protocol on Bilateral Political Consultations (2006), MoU on Tourism Cooperation (2007), MoUs on Culture, Education and Scientific Cooperation (2007), on Strengthening Cooperation in all Sectors for Investment (2007) and Roadmap for Bilateral Political and Economic Relations (2010) had not been followed up. He knew that while most of these agreements were not directly related to exports, activity generated under them could bring Pakistan in news and provide visibility to the country.

Communication between the Commercial Section and the Pakistan's Mission Madrid was minimal and limited only to exigent issues. Each of them was performing its functions in silos. What was even more alarming that, going by the record of the Commercial Section, communication with trade bodies and stakeholders, both within Spain and Pakistan was weak and irregular.

Preparing an ambitious Export Promotion Strategy

The Commercial Counsellor decided to conduct an indepth study of the bilateral economic and trade data and identify demand and supply constraints. His analysis revealed that Pakistan's export to Spain suffered since setting in of a financial and economic recession in 2008. There was a slight recovery in 2011 followed by a decline again in 2012. He believed that since the Spanish economy was entering a recovery phase, implementation of a carefully designed export promotion strategy would benefit from the supporting environment. In his assessment, it was possible to double Pakistan's exports to Spain in three years starting from 2013. But before pursuing a promotion strategy, he realized that he needed to put his own house in order. The Counsellor devised a mechanism of seamless and regular communication with Head of the Mission, Head of the Chancery and the Political Counsellor of the Embassy of Pakistan with the objective of creating a broad-based ownership of

future export marketing initiatives by the trade mission. As a next step, challenges in the Spanish market were analyzed viz-a-viz strengths of the corresponding stakeholders and a consensus on the future course of action was evolved with joint ownership of the export enhancement strategy by the Trade Development Authority of Pakistan (TDAP), Ministry of Commerce and all other internal & external stakeholders.

To overcome information constraints, the Commercial Counsellor started development of a database of exports and exporters. He developed comprehensive lists of various Pakistani products and exporters with their manufacturing processes, raw materials used, details of quality standards being observed, compliance to safety and international protocols and pricing information. The next step was to identify potential importers. Contacts were established with the leading large Spanish companies, small to medium companies & their buying agents, big buying houses & fashion designers, leading Chambers of Commerce & Industries, government institutions namely ACCIO11, ICEX12, FEDECON13, Ministry of Industry, Trade & Tourism and Ministry of External Affairs etc. to obtain corresponding data of the intended export market for making effective inroads.

A three-tiered approach was adopted for doubling Pakistan's exports to Spain in three years period from 2013-15 as an achievable target:

- i. **Short Term Strategy:** This involved mapping of human and financial resources as well as of strategic internal and external stakeholders, their realignment and management for reversing the declining trend of Pakistani exports to Spain in first year i.e. 2013 and achieving a quantum jump in second year i.e. 2014. It focused upon swapping expensive initiatives of previous years (e.g. participation in multiple trade fairs) with relationship building with stakeholders operating in priority sectors and image-building.
- ii. **Medium Term Strategy:** He resolved that the Annual Business Plan would be subjected to yearly evaluations to monitor progress achieved as well as to fill gaps during mid-course corrections to ensure achievement of the goal of doubling of Pakistani exports in the third year i.e. 2015. Simultaneously, avenues of technical collaborations in sectors other than prioritized products would also be explored to improve Pakistan's competitiveness for better exports prospects beyond 2015. Between 2016 and 2017, the focus would be on prioritized Pakistani products in the Spanish market so as to outflank other global competitors such as Bangladesh, Turkey, India, China etc.
- iii. **Long Term Strategy:** This would cover the post-2017 period for which it was aimed

Case Study: Effectiveness of Commercial Diplomacy for Export Promotion I

to achieve sustained growth of broad-based exports from Pakistan vis-à-vis other global competitors and also attracting Spanish investment by utilizing the individual as well as institutional linkages established by that time.

In the short term, the Commercial Section decided to concentrate on five priority products. After a detailed analysis of market demand and competitive advantage, the Commercial Counsellor selected the following product groups: knitted garments, non-knitted/woven garments, bedlinen & bedwear, denim cloth and rice. Another five products i.e. cotton cloth, cotton yarn, artificial and synthetic textile, finished leather and sports goods were placed in the next category. An export promotion and enhancement strategy was devised with a focus on three cornerstones: (i) improving marketing, (ii) ensuring reliable supply and (iii) earning buyers' satisfaction of those ten key export products in the targeted Spanish market.

Concerted marketing efforts were required for establishing business connections between stakeholders in Pakistan and Spain. Language was the first barrier he faced in contacting Spanish firms. The Commercial Counsellor addressed the communication gap by hiring services of a Spanish citizen of British descent as Trade Development Officer (TDO). The new incumbent was immediately assigned the task of responding to trade queries. Each and every trade query about major Pakistani products started to be responded to by qualifying the detailed description with pricing and contact details of prospective Pakistani manufacturers/exporters. A meticulous record was kept of trade queries and follow up was carried out to see whether supply of information had initiated business. Similarly, for each prioritized product, comprehensive lists of renowned Pakistani exporting companies earlier prepared in consultation with TDAP¹⁴, Pakistan Customs, product specific exporters associations, Chambers of Commerce & Industries, Federal ministries of Commerce, Industries & Textile were made available to the Spanish importers. Correspondingly, lists of top Spanish importing companies and major buying houses of main products of Pakistan's commercial interest were also shared with TDAP, exporters associations and leading Pakistani exporters. Prospective customers were informed about Pakistani products being offered, their prices and availability. As and when required, additional information was also provided to them on priority. To institutionalize this arrangement, a Helpline was setup at the Commercial Section having lists of Frequently Asked Questions (FAQs) as well as details of Resource Persons (RP) within Pakistani chambers and associations.

To deal with the negative perception about Pakistan, the Commercial Counsellor now turned to trade disputes. He was aware of the damage that the voice of one importer facing a failed transaction caused to the country image. Through files, he

found out that a number of Spanish importers had complained against some Pakistani exporters and alleged fraud, dishonoring of the timelines or supply of substandard products. The Counsellor designed a proforma for recording complaints and a Complaint Management System (CMS) was put in place for instant referral of the matter to concerned companies and relevant trade bodies. This was coupled with a monitoring tool that kept liaison with TDAP and ICEX15 for timely resolution of such disputes. Effective resolution and follow up of trade disputes helped in improving traders' confidence in Pakistan as a reliable sourcing country. Where the disputes lingered on, regular contact by the mission signaled concern at the governmental level.

For reversing the declining trend of exports, the Commercial Counsellor wanted to harvest low hanging fruits by concentrating upon the major buying houses who owned chain stores and major retail outlets for sale of imported products. He shortlisted 15 Buying Houses and looked at their import potential for knitted and non-knitted garments, Bed-linen & Bed-wear, Cotton Cloth, Artificial Silk and Synthetic Textile items, Leather garments, Football and Rice etc. He contacted them regularly and offered to facilitate by sharing details of exporters and their product information and promotional material and after eliciting their interest, offered match making and assistance in initiating business with Pakistan. As part of a robust monitoring and review mechanism, a minimum of eight meetings per month were held with the management of the top nine (9) Buying Houses and top fifteen (15) Spanish Fashion Groups.

The Commercial Counsellor after evaluating feedback received from past experiences, slashed down participation in trade fairs to 2-3 events which were most relevant to the prioritized Pakistani export products. For meaningful marketing, the Commercial Section developed templates and promotional material including bulletins and brochures to be shared with the prospective buyers. Moreover, the Commercial Counsellor convinced TDAP to sponsor only those delegates who were exporters of the top ten prioritized Pakistani products.

Visits of Trade Delegations of Lahore Chamber of Commerce & Industry (LCCI), PCSUMEA16, REAP17 and Faisalabad Chamber of Commerce & Industries (FCCI) were arranged to Spain during 2013 and 2014. Pakistani manufacturers/exporters became aware of the importance of displaying their correct product specifications in eye-catching brochures. Consequently, they launched and shared their web portals, disseminated product reviews and testimonials and upgraded online adverts to show case their products in an effective and result-oriented manner. In all of these e-marketing efforts, the exporters were guided by the trade mission.

Case Study: Effectiveness of Commercial Diplomacy for Export Promotion I

In 2014, while analyzing the dynamics of Spanish market it transpired to the Commercial Counselor that a sizeable share of Spanish import of consumer items was sourced through local agents who had strong associations in each region. These local agents, on behalf of their principal companies, negotiated buying agreements for importing products like readymade garments, home textile, leather and leather goods, beauty care and surgical instruments etc. Realising their significance, contact details and addresses of different local agents and their product specific associations were consolidated and shared with the Pakistani exporting community for their commercial benefit.

The Commercial Counsellor started the practice of regular on-site meetings and hosted business lunches and dinners in addition to sending gifts and souvenirs on special occasions of Christmas, Easter, etc. The above efforts to reach out to the stakeholders allayed the fears and misperceptions of Spanish entrepreneurs about Pakistan and its business community. Consequently, an increasing number of Spanish businessmen started visiting Pakistan who were duly facilitated by speedy issuance of their business visas through same day verifications from Pakistan.

Early signs of success:

Trade with Pakistan began to appear on the Spanish business horizon. The number of business visas issued for Pakistan during 2nd half of 2013 was a directly measurable variable which depicted a two-fold increase. The Commercial Counsellor's extensive and aggressive export marketing strategy yielded positive dividends and the Trade Mission, Spain sent the largest trade delegation from Eurozone countries to Expo-Pakistan, 2013. By end 2013, the synergized efforts of aligning internal and external stakeholders not only resulted in reversing the declining trend of Pakistan's exports to Spain but also exhibited a positive growth of +12% as compared to the negative growth of -6% during 2012.¹⁸

Tailwind:

Granting of GSP-Plus status to Pakistan by EU in early 2014 substantially improved Pakistan's competitiveness in EU market as it provided duty free access to Pakistan on 66% of European Union's tariff lines¹⁹. The stage was set for the year 2014 to record an all-time high increase in Pakistan's exports to Spain by utilizing the extensive linkages forged during 2013 as well as the enhanced market access made available to Pakistani products through grant of GSP- Plus status to Pakistan.

In line with expectations, an increase of +44% in Pakistan's exports to Spain was achieved. Pakistan's export to Spain rose from Euro 425 million for the year 2013 to

Euro 613 million for the year 2014. The Commercial Counsellor's diligent planning and execution of a product and image focused strategy had started to bear fruit.

More Aggressive Efforts:

In the start of 2015, an ACCIO20 Prospection Delegation was organized to Pakistan. The Trade Mission, in coordination with TDAP, organized meetings of ACCIO delegation with FPCCI, LCCI, FCCI, ICCI, and BOI in addition to B2B meetings with potential business partners. The success of the Prospection Delegations visit was immediately capitalized and ACCIO's major trade delegation was organized within four months. The Delegation comprising of 15-20 leading Catalan companies dealing in industry, investment and trade visited Pakistan during September-October, 2015. This visit laid the foundations for sustainable commercial relations between Pakistani companies and their Catalan counterparts. As the next aggressive step, the Trade Mission Madrid, in collaboration with the ICEX, organized a Trade & Investment Seminar in Madrid wherein representatives of 25 top Spanish companies of different sectors participated.

Trade figures of 2015 were truly refreshing for the Commercial Counsellor: exports to Spain exhibited a growth of +21% which was again more than double Pakistan's cumulative growth rate of 10% for EU 28 countries. Eurostat data depicted that during three years period from 2013-2015, Pakistan's exports to Spain had increased from Euro 379 million in year 2012 to Euro 747 million in year 2015 i.e. an export growth of 96.81% over the base year of 2012. During Annual Bilateral Consultations (ABCs) held in early 2016 at Madrid, the Spanish Secretary of State for External Affairs congratulated his Pakistani counterpart as well as Pakistan's Ambassador for Spain on doubling Pakistan's exports to Spain and crossing the milestone of \$ 1 billion.

Analysis:

A trade mission is at the front-end of a number of public and private sector organisations jointly working to promote exports. By nature, it is essentially a "business-government" interface. Ruel and Visser define the work of a trade mission i.e. commercial diplomacy as "an activity conducted by state representatives that is aimed at generating commercial gain in the form of trade and inward investment for the home country by means of business and entrepreneurship promotion and facilitation activities in the host country based on supplying information about export and investment opportunities, keeping contact with key actors and maintaining networks in relevant areas."²¹ Developing countries like Pakistan invest considerable resources in setting up and sustaining trade missions. Apart from

Case Study: Effectiveness of Commercial Diplomacy for Export Promotion I

ascertaining performance on the basis of export figures, little is known about what enhances the effectiveness of a Commercial Diplomat. Even though there is scant literature linking trade promotion effort with actual export performance, effective business strategies can capitalize on existing opportunities and positive economic environment. This case study traces results of systematic export promotion efforts of a Commercial Diplomat during a period when two important developments took place: Pakistan was awarded GSP-Plus in 2014 which ensured duty free access to Pakistani exporters in the European Union, and the Spanish economy started its recovery.

The approach of the Commercial Counselor posted at Madrid Spain was akin to that of a “business promoter”. He strategically concentrated on market research, promotion and marketing of five(5) priority products and development of databases in the first stage. An International Trade Centre (ITC) cross-country study, talking about national level strategies, concludes that focusing trade promotion activities on a reduced number of sectors and/or markets yields higher returns than spreading existing and limited resources thinly to cover all sectors and markets²². Bridging informational constraints was a much needed requirement that the Commercial Counselor addressed through proactive dissemination and a responsive approach using a Helpline. Parallel to this effort was the work done to reinvigorate communication channels with the main diplomatic mission and stakeholders in Pakistan to create ownership for trade promotion efforts. He invested in development of social capital and networks and resorted to periodic face-to-face meetings rather than sporadic ones on need basis. This was helpful in development a cordial working relationship. In the early part of his tenure, he identified negative perception of Pakistan as one of the key issues discouraging Spanish importers to engage with Pakistani businesses. He sought to address this through a professional approach to commercial dispute resolution. Progressively, his marketing tactics became more ambitious. He engaged business delegations from Pakistan to come to Spain in carefully selected trade fairs for which he not only acted as facilitator but offered active advice for development of promotional material. His most effective strategy was involving local importers’ networks and buying houses and finally arranging a large buyers’ delegation to Pakistan in 2015. The discerning features of the Commercial Diplomat’s operational strategy were: addressing internal weaknesses as a priority; relying on evidence and concentrating efforts in a reduced number of sectors in view of limited resources; adopting a gradual strategy by first arresting decline in exports followed by more aggressive market-capturing efforts; establishing clear communication channels and directly engaging with stakeholders

at home and in the host country; building social capital through regular contacts; and finally, adopting a damage-control approach on trade disputes through regular feedback.

In addition to operational aspects, the case study serves to reveal personal attributes of the Commercial Diplomat as one who was not shy in reaching out to key stakeholders. He understood importance of the “regularity” factor in maintaining the trade mission’s social networks. His motivation in developing the Business Plan and perseverance in following it with frequent mid-course corrections is evident in the narrative. The Commercial Diplomat in this case combined proactive and reactive roles. As a strategic planner, he made use of Freeman’s “stakeholder management” approach which emphasizes managing different groups and relationships in a strategic fashion. His direct relationship with business chambers at home is reflective of the fact that he created their stake in the working of his office thus maximizing the potential of cooperation between the mission and the chambers. It is quite probable that the interest of Spanish businesses was linked with Pakistan’s getting GSP-Plus status and the positive growth in the economy; as an “opportunity seeker” the Commercial Counselor was able to capitalize the opportunity by igniting their latent interest.

Conclusion:

Evidence on what makes an effective commercial diplomat is almost non-existent, partly because of lack of interest by researchers and partly due to the fact that it is almost impossible to construct a counterfactual. Trade performance is the outcome of multifarious variables many of which are beyond the control of individual officers. In case of bilateral trade between Pakistan and Spain between 2013 and 2016, two factors were salutary for our exports: one, exporters faced a conducive market access environment as a result of GSP-Plus concessions and two, the Spanish economy started recovery. Nevertheless, the case study under discussion underlines the importance of implementing a well-thought out Business Plan that resulted in positive trade outcomes. In conceptualising the Business Plan, the Commercial Counselor assumed the proactive role of a “business promoter”. The actions that he undertook included research, planning and agenda-setting with ownership of key stakeholders, identifying and engaging key stakeholders, developing and sustaining business contacts through regular meetings, prioritizing products for extensive promotion, narrowing the choice of trade fairs for participation, hiring local expertise, better management of commercial disputes, arranging business delegations and lastly, keeping the business strategy under constant review for course correction. Personality traits such as motivation, perseverance, a problem-

solving approach and the ability to reach out to stakeholders come out as desirable personal characteristics for a Commercial Diplomat.

Recommendations:

For policy makers in the Ministry of Commerce and trade promotion organizations such as TDAP, the following recommendations derived from the case study and its analysis can be of use:

1. Following the practice of established corporate sector entities and even some national civil services, selection of trade officers needs to take into account the “personality type” of an applicant. A Personality Test will be instrumental in assessing whether a certain applicant is demonstrating behavior that is helpful in achieving responsibilities expected of a Commercial Diplomat. The Ministry of Commerce may identify personality traits of a “business promoter” or seek the help of professional experts to do so, followed by design of a Personality Test for shortlisting purposes.
2. Export Promotion Strategies are usually designed at the capitals however, each country has her own peculiar business culture. This demands that autonomy be given to Commercial Diplomats to propose their own plans developed through a consultative process resulting in ownership by all stakeholders who would then be willing to lend their support to planned activities. Business Plans must take into consideration opportunities in the host country and preparedness of Pakistani exporters.
3. This case study highlights the need for MOC and TDAP to consider factors other than historical trends to fix national export targets. Host country’s salutary economic conditions and new market access offered by concessional trade agreements are examples of two such factors that can accelerate export growth surpassing historical trajectories.
4. Lessons of experience must be shared by Commercial Diplomats; an Experience Sharing Platform can be established where positive and negative experiences are shared. ‘Good Practice Guidelines’ may be developed as a ‘living document’ aligned with TDAP’s overall strategy. The Guidelines, inter alia, may standardize designs of a Trade Mission’s informational products, propose the required frequency with which databases need to be updated, designate TDAP/MOC focal persons for types of trade disputes, advise on preparations for business meetings, etc. Each Commercial Diplomat should also be required to leave detailed Handover Notes for his successor.

5. Ideally, advice on e-marketing and development of promotional material (which is a critical factor in market development) should be offered by TDAP offices in Pakistan. TDAP may consider charging a fees for personalized services.

Endnotes

¹ The case study discussed in this article was submitted by Mr. Faiz Ahmed (Pakistan Customs Service) as requirement for the 109th National Management Course under the title “Doubling of Pakistan’s Exports to Spain Under Challenging Circumstance”. It was supervised by Mr. Farhan Aziz Khawaja and has been reviewed by Sarah Saeed, Directing Staff, National School of Public Policy, Lahore.

² World Bank; <https://data.worldbank.org/indicator/NE.EXP.GNFS.ZS?view=chart> accessed 11th July, 2019

³ Mahmood, Asif; Export Performance of Pakistan: A Constant Market Share Analysis; in SBP Research Bulletin, Vol. 11, Number 1, 2015

⁴ Jomini, Patrick, Xiao-guang Zhang and Michelle Osbourne; The Armington-Heckscher-Ohlin Model – An Intuitive Explanation; Paper Presented at the 12th Annual Conference on Global Economic Analysis, Santiago, Chile 2009

⁵ Sagartz, Andrew; Resolution of International Commercial Disputes: Surmounting Barriers of Culture without Going to Court; 13 Ohio St. J. on Disp. Resol. 675 (1997-1998)

⁶ Nray, Olivier; Commercial Diplomats in the Context of International Business; The Hague Journal of Diplomacy, Vol 6, Issues 1-2; Jan 2011

⁷ Huub Ruel and Robin Visser; Commercial Diplomats as Corporate Entrepreneurs: Explaining Role Behaviour from an Institutional Perspective”; Int. J. Diplomacy and Economy, Vol. 1, No. 1, 2012

⁸ <https://www.thelocal.es/20170326/after-crisis-spain-textiles-sector-dons-new-colours>

⁹ Ibid.

¹⁰ Ibid.

*. Source: DataComex. Ministry of Industries, Trade & Tourism, Spain

¹¹ Catalan Agency for Competitiveness

¹² Espana Exportacion & Inversiones (Trade & Investment Authority of Spain)

¹³ Spanish Inter-textile Council of the Spanish Federation of Garments Industry

¹⁴ Trade Development Authority Pakistan

¹⁵ Trade and Investment Authority of Spain

¹⁶ Pakistan Cutlery & Stainless Utensils Manufacturers & Exporters Association

¹⁷ Rice Exporters’ Association of Pakistan

¹⁸ Eurostat, Office of the Pakistan’s Trade Minister, Brussels, Embassy of Pakistan, Brussels, Belgium.

¹⁹ European Commission; Interim Evaluation of EU’s GSP Scheme; January, 2017 accessed from

²⁰ Catalan Agency for Competitiveness

²¹ Ruel, H.J.M. and Visser, Robin; Commercial Diplomats as Corporate Entrepreneurs: Explaining Role Behaviour from an Institutional Perspective; accessed from www.researchgate.net on 15th November, 2019

²² International Trade Centre (ITC) and University of Geneva; Investing in Trade Promotion Generates Revenue (Report); ITC, Geneva; 2016